

Programs for Elementary Struggling Readers Meeting ESSA Evidence Standards

Below is a list of reading programs that meet the strong, moderate, or promising levels of evidence defined in the ESSA Evidence Standards. Within categories, programs are listed in order by a combination of average effect size, number and quality of studies, and collective sample size. Programs marked with a star (*) had the strongest evidence, with at least one randomized experiment with positive outcomes, one or more additional studies, and an average effect size of at least +0.20.

STRONG EVIDENCE OF EFFECTIVENESS

*Reading Recovery: 1-1 tutoring by teachers, with extensive PD. Struggling first graders receive daily 30-minute tutoring for 12 to 20 weeks. Gr. 1.

*Success for All: Whole-school approach emphasizing phonics, cooperative learning, family support for all, tutoring for struggling readers. PK-5.

*Sound Partners: 1-1 tutoring by teachers or paras emphasizing explicit phonics. K-3.

*Lindamood Phonetic Sequencing (LIPS) (AKA Auditory Discrimination in Depth): 1-1 tutoring by teachers, emphasizing phonemic awareness, teaching children to notice how they make sounds. K-5.

*Targeted Reading Intervention (TRI): 1-1 tutoring by teachers, delivered remotely by webcam. Focus on rural schools. K-1

*Empower Reading (AKA PHAST): Tutoring by teachers to groups of 4-8. Focus on students with learning disabilities. Mostly Canada. Gr. 2-5.

QuickReads: Tutoring by paras to 2 children at a time, 120 min/wk. Gr. 2-5.

Book Buddies: 1-1 tutoring by volunteers supervised by reading specialists. Gr. 1.

SMART (Start Making a Reader Today): 1-1 tutoring by adult volunteers, shared book reading in 30-minute sessions. PK-3.

Read, Write, & Type: Computer-assisted instruction emphasizes visual and auditory learning, with animations focused on phonics. K-2.

Edmark Reading Program: 1-1 tutoring by teachers or paras, designed to build a 150-word reading vocabulary for students not succeeding with phonetic teaching. K-1.

SpellRead: Tutoring to groups of 5 by teachers in 60-90 min. daily lessons. Extensive PD for tutors. Gr. 2-5.

Wilson Reading: Tutoring 1-1 or in groups up to 6 by teachers. Multisensory approach based on Orton-Gillingham. Extensive PD. Gr. 2-5.

Experience Corps: 1-1 tutoring by senior volunteers, who receive 25 hours of PD. K-5.

Reading Partners: 1-1 tutoring by volunteers, supervised by AmeriCorps members. Gr. 3-5.

MODERATE EVIDENCE OF EFFECTIVENESS

Early Steps/Howard Street Tutoring: 1-1 tutoring by teachers, paras, or volunteers, with extensive PD. Gr. 1-3.

Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC): Whole-school cooperative learning approach emphasizing comprehension and writing strategies. Extensive PD. Gr. 2-5.

Peer Assisted Learning Strategies (PALS): Whole-class partner reading. Students take turns as "coach" and "reader." Complements regular teaching, 90 min./wk. Gr. 1

Corrective Reading: Structured whole-class or small-group remedial approach with strong emphasis on phonics. Gr. 2-5.

Reading Rescue: 1-1 tutoring by teachers, paras, or volunteers, with program coordinators in each school. Daily structured 30-min. sessions. Gr. 1.

Early Intervention in Reading (EIR): Tutoring by teachers to small groups to supplement regular instruction. K-3.

Fast ForWord: Computer-assisted instruction. Adaptive, self-paced games. Assistance provided online from remote teachers. Gr. 3-6

PROMISING EVIDENCE OF EFFECTIVENESS

Project Read: whole-class approach based on Orton-Gillingham Multisensory methods. Gr. 1-3.

Read Naturally: small-group supplementary approach focused on building fluency. Students work with audio recordings to reach fluency targets. Gr. 3-5